



TOLEDO AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
BOARD OF TRUSTEES MEETING
DECEMBER 16, 2021

MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER

President Hoagland called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m.

ROLL CALL

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Kelsie Hoagland – President
Mary Morrison – Vice President
Pat McKinstry
Samuel Olaniran
Lou Thomson
Kevin Weeks

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

Heather Baker
James Caldwell
Michael Hart
Katie Hunt-Thomas
Patrick Kijowski
Kendra Smith

OFFICERS PRESENT

Laura Koprowski – Chief Executive Officer
Sophie Giviyani-Kermani – Secretary-Treasurer
Joan Rife – General Counsel

There was not a quorum present at the start of the meeting, and it was necessary to move to Public Comments.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Communications and Marketing Manager Andy Cole read comments from Jessica Weinberg regarding TARPS fares.

President Hoagland announced that two long-time employees would be retiring soon, Mark Wisniewski and Patricia Braden.

Ms. Koprowski added that both have achieved 32 years of service as bus operators and are highly regarded by their supervisors and colleagues.

Director of Operations Richard Cowart said that both employees were known for their hard work, dedication, and love of Toledo. Mr. Cowart read a letter from Mr. Wisniewski's children congratulating their father on his career and upcoming retirement.

Plaques will be sent to these employees honoring their 32 years of service.

SECOND ROLL CALL

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Kelsie Hoagland – President
Mary Morrison – Vice President
Michael Hart – arrived after this roll call
Pat McKinstry
Samuel Olaniran
Kendra Smith
Lou Thomson
Kevin Weaks

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

James Caldwell
Heather Baker
Katie Hunt-Thomas
Patrick Kijowski

With a quorum present the meeting continued.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

Ms. Smith made a motion to approve the minutes from the November 18, 2021, Board of Trustees meeting. Mr. Olaniran seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Mr. Thomson made a motion to enter Executive Session at 4:18 p.m. for discussion concerning negotiations or bargaining with public employees concerning compensation or other terms and conditions of employment. The motion was seconded by Mr. Weaks and approved unanimously.

Vote by roll call.

Michael Hart – entered at 4:21 p.m.
Kelsie Hoagland – yes
Pat McKinstry – yes
Mary Morrison – yes
Samuel Olaniran – yes
Kendra Smith – yes
Lou Thomson – yes
Kevin Weaks – yes

A motion was made and seconded to return to regular session at 4:40 p.m. Vice President Morrison made a motion to move forward with the Memorandums of Understanding as presented. The motion was seconded by Mr. Thomson and approved unanimously.

The motion passed unanimously.

PRESENTATIONS

TARTA Vehicle Update, John Jones, Director of Maintenance

Mr. Jones reviewed the federally identified Useful Life Benchmark (ULB) for revenue service vehicles, heavy duty buses, service and support vehicles and motorized equipment. He also reviewed the Vehicle Condition Rating Scale where 5 indicates a new vehicle and 1 indicates a

vehicle no longer in service. This system uses various subsystems to calculate a final score for each TARTA fleet vehicle.

The Transit Asset Management (TAM) Plan is a business model required by all FTA grant recipients that prioritizes funding based on condition and performance to achieve and maintain a state of good repair for the nation's public transportation assets including vehicles, facilities, equipment, and infrastructure.

Mr. Jones compared the TAM Plan goals for the TARTA fleet with the current TARTA fleet averages. Over 70% of the TARTA revenue fleet has exceeded its ULB.

In 2022 TARTA will take delivery on the following vehicles.

- 6 Promaster 1500 Series ADA vans
- 4 Promaster 3500 Series ADA vans
- 2 Star Trans/Chevrolet ADA Cutaway buses
- 12 35-ft. Gillig Heavy Duty buses
- 12 Glaval/Ford ADA Cutaway buses

Discussion ensued regarding the process for replacing vehicles and periodically sharing with the public efforts to update the fleet.

2022 Operating Budget, Sophie Giviyani-Kermani, Chief Financial Officer

The following are highlights from the 2022 Operating Budget.

- Passenger Fares - \$1,053,000 – Estimated based on 2019 ridership and adjusted for partial year collections.
- Contracts - \$317,000 – Adjusted down due to expiration of the Toledo Public School contract.
- Total Operating Revenues - \$1,370,000
- Operating Expenses include:
 - Labor
 - Fringe Benefits
 - Materials and Supplies
 - Services
 - Fuel
 - Miscellaneous
 - Total Operating Expenses - \$30,662,189
- Operating Loss Before Depreciation – (\$29,292,189)
- Depreciation - \$2,674,700
- Operating Loss Including Depreciation – (\$31,966,889)
- Non-Operating Revenue
 - Property Taxes – \$13.2 million – Received retroactive from 2021.
 - Sales Tax – \$12.5 million – Estimated as receipt will begin in April with a four-month lag.
 - Federal Operating and Preventive Maintenance Assistance – No additional COVID related funds are anticipated in 2022 at this time.
- Total Non-Operating Revenue - \$33.3 million
- Net Gain Before Capital Grants - \$1.4 million
- Capital Grants - \$8,965,700

- Changes in Net Position - \$10,346,344 positive

FINANCE COMMITTEE

Mr. Thomson reported that the Finance Committee met on December 9, 2021. The Committee reviewed the 2022 Operating Budget and recommends approval as presented. Due to the many changes facing TARTA in the future, the Committee would like to monitor the progress in 2022 and revisit the budget no later than June 30, 2022.

NOMINATING COMMITTEE

Mr. Thomson reported that the Nominating Committee met on December 9, 2021. The slate of officers as determined by the Nominating Committee for 2022 is Kelsie Hoagland, President and Mary Morrison, Vice President.

Mr. Thomson asked if there were any comments, concerns, questions, or other nominations by the Board members present. There were none.

Mr. Hart made a motion to approve the slate of officers as presented. Ms. Smith seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

RESOLUTIONS

RESOLUTION NO. 55-21 – A RESOLUTION TO AMEND MEMBERSHIP IN THE TOLEDO AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY TO INCLUDE LUCAS COUNTY AS A MEMBER

Ms. Rife introduced Resolution No. 55-21. This resolution is necessary to comply with the recently amended Ohio Revised Code (ORC). The ORC was amended to add Lucas County as a member without unanimous consent of all members and place sales tax on the ballot. The resolution closes the loop and asks the Board to confirm that TARTA has complied with all statutory provisions and Lucas County will join the Authority as a full member.

Discussion ensued regarding representation on the TARTA Board of Trustees when Lucas County becomes a full member on April 1, 2022.

Mr. Hart made a motion to approve Resolution No. 55-21. It was seconded by Vice President Morrison. The motion passed unanimously.

RESOLUTION NO. 56-21 – MAKING APPROPRIATIONS FOR EXPENDITURES OF THE TOLEDO AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY DURING THE CALENDAR YEAR 2022

Ms. Giviyani-Kermani introduced Resolution No. 56-21. As recommended by the Finance Committee, the 2022 Operating Budget will be reviewed in May or June 2022.

Mr. Thomson made a motion to approve Resolution No. 56-21. It was seconded by Vice President Morrison. The motion passed unanimously.

RESOLUTION NO. 57-21 – AUTHORIZING THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TO EXECUTE A PURCHASE ORDER FOR THE PURCHASE OF TWELVE (12) LIFT EQUIPPED PARATRANSIT BUSES UTILIZING THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TERM CONTRACT 2022-LTV-FSSWLL 248-22

Ms. Giviyani-Kermani introduced Resolution No. 57-21. TARTA was offered the opportunity by a vendor to purchase these paratransit vehicles ahead of schedule and at a substantial savings compared to future pricing.

Mr. Hart made a motion to approve Resolution No. 57-21. It was seconded by Mr. Thomson. The motion passed unanimously.

RESOLUTION NO. 58-21 – ADOPTS THE ANNUAL REVIEW AND UPDATE OF THE TARTA PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCY SAFETY PLAN (PTASP) REQUIRED BY THE U. S. DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION AND FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION

Mr. Odimgbe introduced Resolution No. 58-21. The PTASP must be updated annually and approved by the Board.

Vice President Morrison made a motion to approve Resolution No. 58-21. It was seconded by Ms. Smith. The motion passed unanimously.

RESOLUTION NO. 59-21 – AUTHORIZING THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT WITH THE LOWEST MOST RESPONSIBLE BIDDER FOR THE PURCHASE OF DIESEL AND GASOLINE FUEL

Ms. Giviyani-Kermani introduced Resolution No. 59-21. In the past TARTA has purchased fuel as needed based on the market price on the day fuel was needed. This resulted in budget forecasting difficulties. Therefore, the decision was made to join a joint fuel procurement with other transit agencies in Ohio. The purpose of the resolution is to pre-approve a contract with the winning bidder. Due to the volatile nature of the pricing, TARTA is not able to present the Board with the price currently and cannot lock in the price prior to Board approval.

Discussion ensued regarding the transit systems participating in the fuel contract.

Mr. Hart made a motion to approve Resolution No. 59-21. It was seconded by Mr. Thomson. The motion passed unanimously.

PRESENTATIONS RESUMED

Fare Collection Proposal and Timeline, Charles Odimgbe, Chief Operations Officer

Mr. Odimgbe gave an overview of the proposed farebox and fare structure program to be operational by August 1, 2022.

TARTA intends to go cashless consistent with industry trends. The transition to this future option would take an estimated 24 – 30 months. However, they are opting for a cash and cashless system to ensure no rider demographic is left out. Although cash would no longer be accepted on the bus, riders would be able to purchase fares using cash at multiple outlets throughout the county.

Because funding to move forward with a new fare structure is not available currently, Mr. Odimgbe is requesting the Board extend free fare through July 31, 2022.

Mr. Hart made a motion to extend free fare through July 31, 2022. It was seconded by Ms. McKinstry. The motion passed unanimously.

Overview of Employee Benefits, Barbara Rhoades, Executive Director, Ohio Transit Risk Pool

TARTA is a founding member of the Health Pool and Mr. Fight is the current Board Vice President.

TARTA Health Plan Highlights

- Effective January 1, 2022, the Health Pool will switch from Medical Mutual to United HealthCare.
- Wellness visits are covered 100% and the deductible is lowered for all employees.
- One-year subscription to NOOM psychological weight loss program.
- Stream-lined dental and life insurance limits.
- Lower contribution rate for employees.
- The actual cost to TARTA, barring significant large claims, is expected to remain flat for 2022.
- On-line benefits program will be implemented in the first quarter of 2022.
- Health Pool is offering a voluntary, guaranteed issue life insurance for all employees.

SECRETARY-TREASURER'S REPORT

Ms. Giviyani-Kermani's report covered the period ending October 31, 2021.

There are no large differences between October and September and no Operating Revenue to report.

Operating Expenses

- Labor increased slightly from the prior month due to three payrolls instead of two.
- Fringe benefits are low because the budget was slightly high.
- Materials & Supplies are also budgeted high due to the aging fleet.
- Services increased as some of the consultant costs were not budgeted.
- Overall Operating Expenses are larger than budgeted by approximately \$300,000.

The variance in Depreciation from the fall of 2021 year to date actual compared to 2021 budgeted is currently \$2 million. A lower amount was budgeted for 2022.

Federal Operating and Preventive Maintenance Assistance

- TARTA received \$2.8 million in grant revenue in October, which included the following.
 - \$2.2 million in American Rescue Plan funding
 - TARTA's American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) funding is now depleted
 - TARTA has approximately \$1.7 million in COVID stimulus funds remaining
 - \$128,000 in preventive maintenance funding
 - \$500,000 in third-party paratransit funding

Non-Operating Revenue - \$4 million

Net Gain (Loss) Before Capital Grants - \$1 million

Net Position, End of Year - \$1 million

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT

Ms. Koprowski reported briefly on the following items.

- The City of Toledo acknowledged TARTA's 50 years of service with a resolution passed by Toledo City Council.
- The Board can expect to have a Project Labor Agreement for review and approval at the January Board meeting as a policy for TARTA to use with construction projects. This will be approved through a resolution initiating the Policy. If changes occur in the future, a resolution can be passed amending the Policy.

It is likely TARTA will have the opportunity to work with the Northwest Ohio Building Trades Council to grow the number of companies that are Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) certified and help the Authority identify a more diverse workforce.

VICE PRESIDENT'S REPORT

Vice President Morrison, on behalf of herself and President Hoagland, thanked everyone for their hard work this year and wished them a happy and healthy holiday.

REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM BOARD MEMBERS

There were none.

MEETING CALENDAR

Thursday, January 20, 2022 @ 4:00 p.m. at TARPS, 130 Knapp Street, Toledo, Ohio 43604

ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Thomson made a motion to adjourn. It was seconded by Mr. Olaniran. The motion passed unanimously, and the meeting adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

I hereby certify that all members of the Board of Trustees were given notice of the foregoing in person, by telephone, mail, or email more than 48 hours before the meeting.

Sophie Giviyani-Kermani
Secretary-Treasurer

ADOPTED: January 20, 2022


Kelsie Hoagland
President


Sophie Giviyani-Kermani
Secretary-Treasurer