



TOLEDO AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
MARCH 18, 2021 (VIRTUAL MEETING)

MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER

President Hoagland called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL (INITIAL ROLL CALL AT MEETING COMMENCEMENT)

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Kelsie Hoagland – President
Mary Morrison – Vice President
James Caldwell
Katie Hunt-Thomas
Patrick Kijowski
Pat McKinstry
Sam Olaniran
Marc Thompson
Lou Thomson
Kevin Weeks

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

Heather Baker
Michael Hart
Kendra Smith

President Hoagland welcomed Mr. Olaniran to the Board. Mr. Olaniran is one of three representatives from the City of Toledo newly appointed to the TARTA Board.

OFFICERS PRESENT

Kimberly Dunham – Chief Executive Officer
David Robinson – Secretary-Treasurer
Joan Rife – General Counsel

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

Mr. Thomson made a motion to approve the minutes from the February 18, 2021 Board of Trustees meeting. Vice President Morrison seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were none.

PRESENTATIONS

Transforming TARTA Strategic Plan – Ehren Bingaman, Principal, TransPro Consulting

Ms. Dunham prefaced the presentation by saying that work on the Transforming TARTA Strategic Plan began late in the summer of 2020 during Phase 1 of the agencywide transformation. Participants in the development of the Plan included the TARTA Board, community partners, customers, staff within individual departments and department heads. This provided an opportunity to lay out the Strategic Plan, develop new mission and vision statements, identify strategic goals, success outcomes, and performance metrics. She thanked everyone for their participation.

Mr. Bingaman said the Plan outlines the highest priority projects that TARTA will focus on over the next five years as they strive to deliver a high-quality customer experience with value to taxpayers. Additionally, the Plan introduces a comprehensive scorecard that management and department heads will monitor and report on quarterly. This will allow community stakeholders to track TARTA's performance as well.

The Plan was structured around four fundamental elements –

- Why TARTA leaders, teams, and staff are driven to deliver high quality service
- What outcomes TARTA strives to achieve
- How TARTA will work toward achieving the goals
- Who within the agency is contributing to achievement of these goals

The Board and public will receive a quarterly report on the progress being made towards the desired outcomes in the success areas.

TARTA 2021 Operating and Capital Budget – David Robinson, Chief Financial Officer

TARTA has a balanced budget for 2021. The year 2020 was a year like no other. Ridership was down, fare collection was suspended, and TARTA received stimulus funds. Trend analysis and financial data from 2019 balanced with efforts that were new from an operating standpoint in 2020 were used in developing the budget.

The budget is presented in three sections – operating budget, capital budget and reserves.

Operating Budget

- Operating Revenue
 - Fare collection is expected to return in the fourth quarter.
 - Two major sources of contract revenue include Toledo Public Schools, ending in June 2021, and University of Toledo, which has been revised.
- Operating Expenses
 - Expenses for 2021 were based on historical trends from 2019.
 - Additional expenses were incurred due to COVID-19.
- Non-Operating Revenue
 - Unrestricted federal funds – one time stimulus funds, which TARTA is using for special needs and operations related to COVID-19.
 - Restricted federal funds – ADA Paratransit and Preventative Maintenance.
 - Property taxes as certified by the County Auditor.

Capital Budget

Time was spent identifying how federal funds are being used and how they lineup with funding sources.

Some federal funds are reimbursed at 100% while others only 80% with a 20% local match.

- Planned opportunities once funding becomes available include –
 - Review of fixed line routes
 - Comprehensive Operational Analysis
 - Facility improvements
 - IT equipment

Federal, state, and local funds are being set aside in the budget for these projects.

Reserve

TARTA recently received additional stimulus funds, of which a portion will be used for current year operation with a portion set aside in reserves.

Discussion ensued regarding the ending of the Toledo Public School contract and the overall effect on TARTA's budget.

Mr. Olaniran asked if there is a timeline on when stimulus funds must be used.

Ms. Dunham replied that typically federal funds must be spent within three years of obligation. Although TARTA can work with the FTA regional office to expand the time. The COVID relief funds are specifically related to the pandemic and there is no indication they will need to be spent in calendar year 2022. TARTA received \$17.8 million in the first round of stimulus funds, \$2.8 million in the second, and slightly over \$15 million in the third.

Ms. Dunham explained the formula used to determine the amount of each round of stimulus funds.

FINANCE COMMITTEE REPORT

Committee Chair Jim Caldwell reported that the committee met on March 16, 2021. He commended Ms. Dunham and Mr. Robinson for their work on the budget. It was very good news that the Senate reinstated the language in the Transportation Budget allowing TARTA to proceed with majority consent as opposed to unanimous consent. This will allow more latitude in terms of making the decision to pursue a levy with additional milage or sales tax.

Mr. Caldwell asked for a motion to approve the 2021 Budget. Mr. Thomson made a motion to approve the 2021 Budget. Vice President Morrison seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Legislative Update – Matt Carle, CHW Advisors

Every two years the Governor of the State of Ohio introduces a transportation budget bill typically earlier than the general operating budget. This bill sets the budgets for the Ohio Department of Transportation, Department of Public Safety, Ohio Works Commission, and any type of spending by the State on roads, infrastructure, and transportation related issues. The bill is typically introduced in early February and generally passed by April 1st.

The language allowing TARTA to add Lucas County to its service area was in the *as introduced* version of the Governor's budget bill. When a bill goes to a Conference committee, they look at the *as introduced* version, the House passed version, and the Senate passed version and their differences. Generally, if two of the three agree in language or provision that version will win. The

TARTA language was included in the as introduced version of the bill, removed by the Ohio House of Representatives, and subsequently added back in by the Ohio Senate.

Mr. Carle expressed his appreciation for the letters of support being sent to the Ohio House and Ohio Senate. To help ensure the language remains in the bill after it goes to the Conference committee, he requested the Board's help in getting more letters of support to Speaker Bob Cupp and his leadership team demonstrating how widely and broadly the TARTA language is supported by folks in Lucas County.

Discussion ensued regarding the process for requesting additional letters of support.

Ms. Dunham commended Mr. Carle for his tireless efforts on TARTA's behalf.

Levy Requirements – Joan Rife, General Counsel

Currently, TARTA has two property taxes, 1 mil and 1.5 mil. Both are ten-year levies running on different cycles. The revenue received from these levies has decreased over the last few years while expenses have increased.

Steps necessary for pursuing a property tax increase –

- State law provides that TARTA may request no more than 5 mils total.
- Board resolution seeking certification from Lucas and Wood county auditors on the current valuation and revenue brought in from the new milage
- Board resolution placing additional property tax on the ballot
- The resolution and auditors' certification must be filed with the respective Board of Elections in Lucas and Wood counties 90 days prior to the election – August 4, 2021 @ 4:00 p.m.

Steps necessary for pursuing a sales tax –

One entire county must be a member of the regional transit authority before sales tax can be levied in Ohio. Under the current structure no entire county is a member and TARTA cannot impose a sales tax. With Lucas County as a member, TARTA would be able to place sales tax on the ballot. However, state law requires the unanimous consent of each member to the inclusion of the County. The current effort is to change the law from unanimous consent to majority consent.

- Sales tax is imposed in one tenth of a percent increment.
- The Board would need to decide how much sales tax is needed to shore up local funds.
- Board resolution placing a sales tax on the ballot.
- TARTA will need to seek consent from each member community.
- The deadline for filing with the respective Board of Elections in Lucas and Wood counties is 90 days prior to the election – August 4, 2021 @ 4:00 p.m.

President Hoagland asked if the Board could take the necessary steps to pursue additional milage, but not be committed to that avenue.

Ms. Rife replied that TARTA would not be committed until filing with the Board of Elections.

Discussion ensued regarding moving forward with a resolution to initiate sales tax or additional milage.

The question was asked if this could be permanent milage.

Ms. Rife will determine whether property or sales tax have opportunities to be permanent and report back to the Board.

Ms. Dunham added that the Blue Ribbon Task Force was developed to look at TARTA's financial situation and recommended .5% sales tax. Based on past sales tax trends from Lucas and Wood counties and from a projection's standpoint, TARTA would receive \$32 million annually in sales tax revenue. She feels very strongly that this conversation should not be started at the ground floor.

Mr. Caldwell agreed.

A copy of the report will be emailed to the Board tomorrow.

Report to the Community – Laura Koprowski, Chief Communications and Customer Experience Officer

The first ever Report to the Community is a look back at the work accomplished last year and provides inspiration going forward. It begins with a community message from the Chief Executive Officer and Board President and identifies the board of trustees and leadership team.

The Report was created around four themes: Transform, Change, Pivot, and Reimagine. It focuses on the new Strategic Plan, Mission, and Vision and outlines the four success goals that will be shared with the community. In all, six plans were developed in 2020 to guide TARTA into the future.

New initiatives and partnerships began in 2020. This was also a time to measure performance while operating safely during a historic pandemic. Achieving financial sustainability, redesigning TARTA, and moving into the future in terms of technology are projects underway for 2021.

RESOLUTIONS

RESOLUTION NO. 9-21 – MAKING APPROPRIATIONS FOR EXPENDITURES OF THE TOLEDO AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY DURING THE CALENDAR YEAR 2021

Mr. Robinson introduced Resolution No. 9-21. This resolution approves the 2021 budget reviewed earlier in today's meeting.

Mr. Caldwell made a motion to approve Resolution No. 9-21. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

RESOLUTION NO. 10-21 – ADOPTS THE TRANSFORMING TARTA 2021-2026 STRATEGIC PLAN

Mr. Robinson introduced Resolution No. 10-21. This resolution outlines the considerations, and items included in the five-year strategic plan.

Mr. Thomson made a motion to approve Resolution No. 10-21. Ms. Morrison seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

RESOLUTION NO.11-21 – AUTHORIZING THE FILING OF APPLICATIONS WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION, UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, FOR GRANTS UNDER THE FEDERAL TRANSIT ACT, AS AMENDED, FOR THE YEAR 2021

Mr. Robinson introduced Resolution No. 11-21. This resolution allows TARTA to begin the process and submit applications with the Department of Transportation to move forward grant programs and grant plans and comply with the Department's regulations.

Mr. Olaniran made a motion to approve Resolution No. 11-21. Ms. McKinstry seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

RESOLUTION NO. 12-21 – AUTHORIZING THE FILING OF APPLICATIONS WITH THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION FOR FY 2022 GRANT FUNDS

Vice President Morrison introduced Resolution No. 12-21. Mr. Robinson said this resolution allows TARTA to move forward with plans and meet the obligations in the various fiscal year regulations.

Mr. Caldwell made a motion to approve Resolution No. 12-21. Mr. Weaks seconded the motion. President Hoagland abstained and the motion passed.

RESOLUTION NO. 13-21 – AUTHORIZING THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TO EXECUTE THE DOCUMENTS NECESSARY TO DIVEST TARTA'S INTERESTS IN PARK STATION

Ms. Dunham introduced Resolution No. 13-21. As part of TARTA's excess real property plan as well as an FTA requirement and best business practice, the parcel at 611 Madison Avenue is considered excess with no future need for TARTA. Park Station (611 Madison Avenue) was used for the downtown loop, now decommissioned. An appraisal and review appraisal were conducted. The result was a fair market value of \$185,000. As it is no longer needed by TARTA in the foreseeable or long-term future, the FTA has been notified of the intent to dispose of this asset. TARTA is seeking approval from the FTA to retain the federal portion of the proceeds to use for another capital project. Ms. Dunham is seeking Board approval to move forward with the sale and remove TARTA from the lease agreement with the City of Toledo.

Mr. Hart made a motion to approve Resolution No. 13-21. Mr. Thomson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

SECRETARY-TREASURER'S REPORT

Ms. Dunham noted that the monthly financial report was forwarded to the Board last week and asked if there were any questions. There were none and no financial report was given.

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT

Ms. Dunham provided the following updates –

- A letter of interest has been submitted to the Ohio Department of Transportation for competitive grant funding for the following projects in fiscal year 2022:
 - Alternative fuels for paratransit vehicle replacement including electric vehicles
 - Maintenance software program
 - Partial funding of the CAD/AVL system
 - Augmented funds to install TV monitors on buses
- Spring Assignment – Frequency on high-capacity core service will be increased.

- TARTA is working with the Lucas County Health Department to provide express shuttle service and Call-A-Ride service to the Maumee Recreation Center for COVID vaccinations. The Governor's "Transit to Community Immunity" Grant Funding in the amount of \$266,000 will be used for this project.
- ADA Sunday Service – TARTA ended Sunday fixed route service and intended to end ADA service as well in April 2019. Private partners established a foundation and provided the local match for FTA funds allowing ADA Sunday service to continue. The service was expected to end in July 2021. However, stimulus funds will be used to extend the service for one year.
- COTA Buses – Twenty buses were delivered this past month with the final six expected to arrive next week.
- Collective Bargaining Negotiations began today with the ATU.
- Transit Employee Appreciation Day 2021 was celebrated today with a box lunch for all employees. President Hoagland and Vice President Morrison provided a great joint letter to all employees on behalf of the TARTA Board.

VICE PRESIDENT'S REPORT

Vice President Morrison extended Transit Employee Appreciation Day wishes to the TARTA leadership team.

PRESIDENT'S REPORT

President Hoagland is very encouraged by all that TARTA is accomplishing. In a year when everyone's lives have been so dramatically affected, TARTA employees have overcome something truly unique.

President Hoagland welcomed Michael Hart and Kendra Smith to the Board representing the City of Toledo. She would like to do a brief introduction session in an upcoming meeting to allow all board members the opportunity to properly introduce themselves.

REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM BOARD MEMBERS

Mr. Thomson commented on the great articles in the Maumee Mirror this past weekend.

MEETING CALENDAR

Thursday, April 15, 2021

FINAL ROLL CALL

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Kelsie Hoagland – President
 Mary Morrison – Vice President
 Heather Baker
 James Caldwell
 Michael Hart
 Katie Hunt-Thomas
 Pat McKinstry
 Sam Olaniran

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

Patrick Kijowski

Kendra Smith
Marc Thompson
Lou Thomson
Kevin Weaks

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.


CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

I hereby certify that all members of the Board of Trustees were given notice of the foregoing in person, by telephone, mail, or email more than 48 hours before the meeting.

David B. Robinson
Secretary-Treasurer

ADOPTED: April 15, 2021


Kelsie M. Hoagland
President


David B. Robinson
Secretary-Treasurer