

TOLEDO AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
BOARD OF TRUSTEES
FEBRUARY 20, 2020

MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER

President Daniel Woodcock called the meeting to order at 8:00 a.m.

Ms. Clink called the roll and advised the President there was not a quorum. Due to there not being a quorum no business could be conducted, and the Board heard public comments.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Ernie Brancheau thanked the Board and General Manager and said 2019 was a rough year for the agency. He touched on the need for improving TARTA's technology and said he has confidence in the new General Manager's ability to bring about much needed changes.

Mr. Brancheau went on to say that the Board meetings are TARTA's only connection to the public and when meetings are cancelled, he would appreciate the information being posted on the website prominently and in a timely manner.

ROLL CALL

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Daniel Woodcock – President
Kelsie Hoagland – Vice President
James Caldwell
Stacy Cook
Patrick Kijowski
Maria King
Mary Morrison
Marc Thompson

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

Frank Frey
Cheryl Grice
Chris Monaghan
Harvey Savage
Kevin Weaks

OFFICERS PRESENT

Kimberly Dunham – General Manager
Stacey Clink – Secretary-Treasurer

Ms. Clink reported that there was now a quorum. The business of the meeting continued.

APPROVAL OF THE JANUARY 9, 2020 BOARD OF TRUSTEES MEETING MINUTES

Ms. King made a motion to approve the January 9, 2020 Board of Trustees meeting minutes. Ms. Hoagland seconded the motion. All members present voted aye.

RESOLUTIONS

RESOLUTION NO. 14-20 – AUTHORIZES A CHANGE IN THE APPOINTMENT OF A TRUSTEE AND ALTERNATE TRUSTEES TO THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE HEALTH TRANSIT POOL OF OHIO

This resolution authorizes adding the General Manager, Director of Human Resources and Director of Finance as alternates.

Ms. Hoagland made a motion to approve Resolution No. 14-20. Mr. Kijowski seconded the motion. All members present voted aye.

RESOLUTION NO. 15-20 – IN SUPPORT OF THE TOLEDO AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY AWARDING FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION SECTION 5310 FUNDS TO NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS FOR THE PURCHASE OF VEHICLES

Two additional organizations were awarded vehicles this application cycle than received them last time.

Mr. Kijowski made a motion to approve Resolution No. 15-20. Ms. King seconded the motion. All members present voted aye.

RESOLUTION NO. 16-20 – AUTHORIZES THE GENERAL MANAGER TO EXECUTE A PURCHASE ORDER FOR THE PURCHASE OF MULTIPLE FORD SUPPORT VEHICLES

This resolution ties into Resolution 17-20. TARTA has approximately 20 support vehicles that are authorized under the Federal Transit Administration and customary in the transit industry for road supervisors, snow removal and for the janitorial team and facilities maintenance to move from one location to another. These vehicles are very old and in urgent need of replacement. TARTA has a federal grant in place and local match dollars were identified to leverage this grant. If approved, these vehicles will be purchased off the state bid and branded TARTA.

President Woodcock asked the cost of the vehicles.

Ms. Clink replied that Resolution No. 16-20 approves \$103,810 and Resolution No. 17-20 approves \$193,764. Federal funds will cover 80% of the cost with local match covering the remaining 20%.

Ms. King made a motion to approve Resolution No. 16-20. Mr. Kijowski seconded the motion. All members present voted aye.

RESOLUTION NO. 17-20 – AUTHORIZES THE GENERAL MANAGER TO EXECUTE A PURCHASE ORDER FOR THE PURCHASE OF MULTIPLE DODGE SUPPORT VEHICLES

Ms. Hoagland made a motion to approve Resolution No. 17-20. Mr. Kijowski seconded the motion. All members present voted aye.

RESOLUTION 18-20 – DECLARING THE NECESSITY OF ISSUING NOTES IN ANTICIPATION OF THE COLLECTION OF CURRENT PROPERTY TAX REVENUES AND AUTHORIZING THE ISSUANCE OF A MAXIMUM PRINCIPAL AMOUNT OF \$1,500,000 TOLEDO AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY TAX ANTICIPATION NOTES

Mr. Caldwell reported that the Finance Committee met earlier this week and reviewed this proposal. After considering the following factors, the Committee is recommending approval of this resolution.

- The Board has approved Tax Anticipation Notes in the past.
- TARTA will have the opportunity to make vendors current in terms of the backlog of accounts payable.
- This will improve moral through anticipated changes, new initiatives and new administration with regards to moving the Authority forward.

As required by federal regulations, TARTA will solicit bids. They looked at the amount of dollars TARTA could borrow compared with their ability to repay the notes should there be challenges with the levy renewals in the future. The Committee feels this will add to the overall growth and stability of the organization.

Ms. Clink added that in the event TARTA experiences difficulties with the levies they will have until 2021 to determine how the organization will be funded and what to do about the Tax Anticipation Notes. She does not expect an issue repaying the notes. The interest has been included in the budget. The length of the note will likely be six months with the probability that they will be renewed later in the year and early next year until sales tax funding is received in July 2021.

Discussion ensued regarding TARTA's need for Tax Anticipation Notes at this time.

Mr. Kijowski made a motion to approve Resolution No. 18-20. Ms. Cook seconded the motion. All members present voted aye.

RESOLUTION NO. 19-20 – ADOPTS AN UPDATE TO THE AUTHORITY'S NONDISCRIMINATION AND TITLE VI COMPLAINT PROCEDURES

This resolution updates the Authority's procedures to meet FTA guidelines.

Ms. Hoagland made a motion to approve Resolution No. 19-20. Mr. Kijowski seconded the motion. All members present voted aye.

RESOLUTION NO. 20-20 – AUTHORIZING THE GENERAL MANAGER TO EXECUTE A CONTRACT FOR MONTHLY SERVICE / MAINTENANCE FEES FOR PASSIO TECHNOLOGIES

This comes to the Board due to the dollar value for monthly service and maintenance fees for the project.

President Woodcock asked the dollar value.

Ms. Clink replied \$78,755.40.

Ms. Hoagland asked if these were fees TARTA was aware of prior to the project.

Ms. Clink replied yes.

Ms. King made a motion to approve Resolution No. 20-20. Mr. Kijowski seconded the motion. All members present voted aye.

RESOLUTION NO. 21-20 – AMENDS THE CURRENT PROCUREMENT POLICIES AND PROCEDURES AND A CODE OF ETHICS FOR THE TOLEDO AREA REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY

This resolution changes the micro purchases from \$3,500 to \$10,000, which meets State guidelines. This policy is expected to be updated again due to changes that the State has not yet adopted allowing the \$100,000 purchase level to be changed to \$250,000 for simple acquisitions, which would make the procurement process quicker.

Mr. Caldwell added that this document was also reviewed and endorsed by the Finance Committee at their recent meeting.

Ms. Hoagland made a motion to approve Resolution No. 21-20. Ms. Cook seconded the motion. All members present voted aye.

SECRETARY-TREASURER'S REPORT

Ms. Clink reported that for the month of December there was a decrease in passenger revenue when compared with budget and a decrease in expenses when compared with budget. Passenger revenues for the month were under last year by 2% and under budget for the month by 9.6%. However, they were over the prior year by 4.3%. Compared with budget revenue is under budget for the year by 6.3% due to school day weather cancellations, decreased adult farebox revenue, token revenue and weekly pass revenue.

Operating expenses for December of \$2.1 million is under the prior year and under budget. There were decreases in all major expense categories with the exception of fuel tax. As this is the end of the year Ms. Clink reviewed all major expense categories and their variance.

- Maintenance expense for the year of \$5.6 million was under the prior year by 13.4% and under budget for the year by 15.8%.
- Service labor wages were down 5.7% in straight time and 17% in overtime when compared with 2018.
- Repair labor decreased due to a 3% increase in regular hours offset by a 36% decrease in overtime hours
- Supervisors salaries increased
- There was a savings in most other categories, with the largest being in repairs to revenue equipment and outsourcing repairs

Compared with budget there were decreases in all categories of expenses.

Fixed line transportation expenses were under the prior year by \$1.3 million. The largest decrease was in operators' wages due to savings created by schedule changes and the

elimination of Sunday and holiday service and the sports shuttle service. Regular hours were reduced by 6,123 hours and there was a reduction of 22,921 overtime hours. Fuel expense also decreased due to reduced mileage and lower fuel costs. The average price of fuel in 2019 was \$2.00 compared with \$2.16 in 2018. Most recently TARTA paid \$1.71 per gallon.

Paratransit expense for the year of \$4.6 million is under the prior year by \$452,000. Like fixed line service, TARPS traveled fewer miles and used less fuel than in 2018. Contract service also decreased by 23% due to the service changes. Paratransit expense is under budget for the year by 7.7%.

General and administrative expense is under the prior year by 10.3%. Marketing expense decreased by \$262,000 due to efforts to reduce costs. There were also decreases in salaries due to multiple open positions in 2019. Utilities and insurance increased due to the opening of the hub in August.

There will be adjustments due to hospitalization and claims liabilities.

Compared with budget, expenses are under budget by \$677,000.

Fixed line ridership in December was under 2018 with decreases in most forms of ridership. Ridership was also under projections for the month. For the year ridership of 1.7 million riders was under the prior year by 23.5% and under projections by 20.1%. There was also a 26% decrease in TARPS riders riding free on TARTA.

EZfare use for the year was 35,489 rides since the program began.

TARPS ridership for the month was down 6.2% and under projections 4.3%. For the year TARPS ridership was 230,672, 5.3% under the previous year, and 3.8% under projections.

The final year-end ridership results from the American Public Transit Association are not yet out. However, when available Ms. Clink will provide this data for comparative purposes.

Paratransit contracted services provided 40,000 riders for the year, which is 9,000 less than the previous year.

Ms. Dunham added that while the team has been working diligently to ascertain ridership data, she does not have confidence in this data. TARTA does not have the technology to provide accurate ridership data. TARTA has a priority need of investing in an integrated farebox system able to accommodate all the passes and provide accurate data.

Mr. Metzger talked about the difficulties they are experiencing with TARTA's current farebox system and the advantages of new technology.

Ms. Dunham added that upgrading the fareboxes would cost approximately \$4 million. Fare collection is a loss control concern. For this reason, TARTA is working diligently with the FTA and ODOT and looking towards a competitive grant application to shore up funding for these and other purchases.

Ms. Dunham will be asking the Auditors to do an audit of the fare reconciliation process to have surety there are no places for loss in the system.

Ms. Dunham went on to say that TARTA faces an incredible challenge when maintaining vehicles. There are 11 different products (make & model) on the fixed line side. Following meetings with the maintenance team four weeks ago Ms. Dunham directed going forward only original equipment manufacturer (OEM) parts be purchased. Over the short-term maintenance costs will likely increase prior to the purchase of new buses. However, it will reduce the need for repeat repairs thereby increasing productivity.

A detailed report is attached to these minutes for reference.

GENERAL MANAGER'S REPORT

Ms. Dunham gave a brief report on the following topics:

- FTA and ODOT Grants – A letter of intent was submitted to ODOT for OTP2 funding that covers the following three focus areas –
 - Planning – consultants will be brought in to provide the following -
Asset Condition Assessment Report
Transit Asset Management Plan
Comprehensive Operations Analysis Report
 - Technology – consultants will be brought in to assist with a Systems Security Framework and Gap Analysis.
 - Buses – \$7.2 million from ODOT to match \$1.8 million CMAQ grant funds
- FTA Human Trafficking Grant Funding – TARTA was pleased to receive the grant as they are very committed to public safety.
- Passio Go – The testing period has been extended to ensure the system is running properly before going live.

Discussion ensued regarding Passio Go and Transit App.

- Ohio Loves Transit Week – TARTA attended meetings with Senators and Representatives in Columbus on Wednesday. On Friday activities were held at the hub along with two very well attended bus rides for public officials.

President Woodcock added that TARTA received proclamations of support from all member communities. The buy-in from elected officials is far and above that of 12 months ago. Ms. Dunham has been to nearly all the city councils and/or public meetings and has presented TARTA's story in a straight-forward manner. He feels the public appreciates that TARTA is beginning to think like a business along with the openness and new energy.

Ms. Dunham said that it is a collective effort. TARTA must change their internal culture, expectations and values to get where they need to be in every aspect.

- Staffing – TARTA has many open positions. Ms. Dunham has been unsuccessful in recruiting a Human Resource Director. Therefore, in the short-term a contract

with a transit management company is being considered. A Request for Proposals will go out late next week and will include the following three areas –

- Technical capacity
- Strategic planning
- Transit management services

President Woodcock asked the approximate cost.

Ms. Dunham replied that the cost is estimated at \$750,000 for people with significant experience in the industry and looking for short-term second tier executive team positions.

- Advertising – Work continues on the final details of the contract with Commuter Advertising. The contract calls for Commuter Ad to wrap all the non-TARTA buses with the current TARTA logo for the \$350,000 owed TARTA. They will also do a window wrap at Perry Station. This project is expected to be completed by May.

OPERATION'S REPORT

Transportation Superintendent Tom Metzger reported that service interruptions, including detours and bus malfunctions, are tracked and recently these numbers have decreased. One contributing factor is that the 300 and 500 series buses are no longer in service.

Mr. Metzger and IT Director Lucas Boehm will be meeting with Swiftly, Inc. regarding better on-time performance reporting.

RECOGNITION

February fixed line Operator of the Month is 4.5-year veteran Janet McMickens.

February Paratransit Operator of the Month is 15-year veteran Jackie Rockwood.

A detailed report is attached to these minutes for reference.

VICE PRESIDENT'S REPORT

Ms. Hoagland thanked the Finance Committee for their work on these extremely critical matters. She commended the communications team for their great work on social media not just during Ohio Loves Transit week, but overall.

PRESIDENT'S REPORT

Mr. Woodcock reported on three items.

- Policy & Marketing Committee – the Committee met in January and agreed on the importance of a subcommittee to focus entirely on countywide policy issues. A meeting of the Policy Subcommittee has been convened for March 2nd. Anyone not on the committee who would like to participate in those discussions is urged to attend. This subcommittee will meet often and only on countywide policy issues and board composition as this needs to be done by April. Mr. Thompson will chair.

- In an effort to have more accurate financial data at the Board meetings, changing the meeting date to the third Thursday of the month is proposed. An informal survey will be done of the Board to gauge feedback on changing the meeting time to afternoon.
- TARTA will offer free rides on March 17, 2020, for Election Day.

Ms. Dunham cautioned over promoting free rides in advance on Election Day due to capacity constraints on TARPS.

Mr. Brancheau requested that in the future if TARTA is offering free rides the next day he would appreciate the announcement being made by 4:00 p.m. the night before.

REPORTS / COMMUNICATIONS FROM BOARD MEMBERS

Ms. King said that once the Policy Subcommittee meeting has been scheduled, monthly meetings will be scheduled for those remaining on the Marketing Committee.

Mr. Caldwell said he is enthused about the level of participation by the Board on the Finance Committee. Finance is an integral part of what they do throughout the entire organization.

MEETING CALENDAR

Thursday, March 19, 2020 at 8:00 a.m. at TARPS, 130 Knapp Street, Toledo, Ohio.

ADJOURNMENT

Ms. Hoagland made a motion to adjourn. Ms. King seconded the motion. All members present voted aye and the meeting adjourned at 9:20 a.m.

CERTIFICATION OF COMPLIANCE

I hereby certify that all members of the Board of Trustees were given notice of the foregoing in person, by telephone, mail or email more than 48 hours before the meeting.

Stacey S. Clink
Secretary-Treasurer

ADOPTED: March 19, 2020

Daniel R. Woodcock
President



Stacey S. Clink
Secretary-Treasurer

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

[Handwritten signatures]

**TARTA
Financial Highlights
As of 12/31/19**

	Actual 2019		Actual 2018		Budget 2019		FIRST CLOSE 2019 COMPARED WITH 2018				FIRST CLOSE 2019 COMPARED WITH BUDGET			
	FIRST CLOSE 12/31/19	FIRST CLOSE YTD 12/31/19	12/31/18	YTD 12/31/18	12/31/19	YTD 12/31/19	December Variance	Percentage Increase/ (- Decrease)	YTD Variance	Percentage Increase/ (- Decrease)	Actual/Budget December Variance	Percentage Increase/ (- Decrease)	Actual/Budget YTD Variance	Percentage Increase/ (- Decrease)
Passenger Revenue	\$ 471,426	\$ 5,787,235	\$ 480,911	\$ 5,546,079	\$ 521,550	\$ 6,178,810	\$ (9,485)	-2.0%	\$ 241,156	4.3%	\$ (50,124)	-9.6%	\$ (391,575)	-6.3%
Operating Expenses	\$ 2,127,260	\$ 26,320,860	\$ 2,409,644	\$ 29,364,800	\$ 2,427,240	\$ 29,149,040	\$ (282,384)	-11.7%	\$ (3,043,940)	-10.4%	\$ (299,980)	-12.4%	\$ (2,828,180)	-9.7%
Net Operating Income (Loss)	\$ (198,497)	\$ (2,214,900)	\$ 1,613,837	\$ 906,539 *	\$ (338,304)	\$ (4,013,100)	\$ (1,812,334)	112.3%	\$ (3,121,439)	-344.3%	\$ 139,807	41.3%	\$ 1,798,200	44.8%

* Note Includes Capital Assistance of \$6,148,990

Items to Note

Maintenance	\$ 373,914	\$ 5,618,254	\$ 444,614	\$ 6,487,858	\$ 591,859	\$ 6,669,270	\$ (70,700)	-15.9%	\$ (869,604)	-13.4%	\$ (217,945)	-36.8%	\$ (1,051,016)	-15.8%
Fixed Line Transportation Expense	\$ 1,007,745	\$ 11,991,547	\$ 1,122,264	\$ 13,298,202	\$ 1,037,059	\$ 12,745,808	\$ (114,519)	-10.2%	\$ (1,306,655)	-9.8%	\$ (29,314)	-2.8%	\$ (754,261)	-5.9%
Paratransit Expense	\$ 388,842	\$ 4,556,891	\$ 463,249	\$ 5,009,088	\$ 398,397	\$ 4,939,251	\$ (74,407)	-16.1%	\$ (452,197)	-9.0%	\$ (9,555)	-2.4%	\$ (382,360)	-7.7%
General/Administrative Expenses	\$ 320,698	\$ 3,846,319	\$ 357,819	\$ 4,289,188	\$ 378,194	\$ 4,523,801	\$ (37,121)	-10.4%	\$ (442,869)	-10.3%	\$ (57,496)	-15.2%	\$ (677,482)	-15.0%

February 6, 2020 Board Meeting

Transportation Report for January 2020

FIXED LINE

On Time Performance (5-minute window)

543 Total Time Checks
61 Late/Early
88%

Code 13 (W/C - Disabled) 327 up 85 from last January up 54 from last month

Code 15 (Bicycles) 255 up 31 from last January down 5 from last month

Detours – 0 Routes currently affected by detours. We received 7 short term road closures with some of those closures negatively impacting service. Dispatch also handled 70 service interruption/train detours.

Active Operator Roster Status F/T Operators (114 / 111 active)
P/ T Operators (13 / 12 active)
Trainee Operators (9) all full time

Other notes of interest:

Fixed Line Coach Operator of the Month
Janet McMickens



February F/L Operator of the Month is Janet McMickens. Janet has been with the company a total of 4.5 years. She achieved all the requirements necessary to obtain this award including perfect attendance over the last 3 months. TARTA has received passenger commendations for Janet's professional and caring performance. The supervisory staff made recommendation for this award. Janet is well respected by her peers and is well deserving of being named Fixed Line Operator of the Month.

TARPS

Active Operator Roster Status F/T Operators (50 / 47 active)
P/ T Operators (6 / 5 active)

TARPS On time performance – **89.3%** (30-minute window)

Rides per hour average – 2.50

Average Ride Time – 24.2 minutes (down .8 minutes)

Average Ride Distance – 5.7 miles (down .4 miles)

Wheelchairs – 4,353 / 21% of total ridership

The highest ridership day was 1097 trips on January 10, 2020

The lowest was January 1, 2020 at 144 trips.

TARPS Coach Operator of the Month

Jackie Rockwood



February Paratransit Coach Operator of the Month is Jackie Rockwood. Jackie has been with TARTA for 15 years. She achieved all the requirements necessary to obtain this award including perfect attendance over the last 2 months. The supervisory staff made recommendation for this award. Jackie is well respected by her peers and is well deserving of being named TARPS Operator of the Month.

